

Fwd: Decision on your manuscript ID ASM-SI-018: Major revision required

abdul syukur <syukurbiologi@unram.ac.id> Min, 4 Agu 2019 14.10

kepada saya

----- Forwarded message -----

Dari: **Phaik-Eem Lim** <icst2017.asm@gmail.com>

Date: Jum, 5 Jul 2019 16:52

Subject: Decision on your manuscript ID ASM-SI-018: Major revision required

To: <syukurbiologi@unram.ac.id>

Dear Dr. Abdul Syukur,

I am writing to you regarding manuscript entitled “The Evidence of Rhizophora as a Potential Species to improve Mangrove Recovery in The Coast of South East Lombok, Indonesia”, which you submitted to ASM Science Journal for the special issue of the 2nd International Conference on Science and Technology in the Tropic (ICST2017). An arbitrary manuscript ID has been assigned for your manuscript and the same ID will be referred in our communication to ease the handling process.

Your manuscript has been reviewed, and we think that the manuscript has its merit, but not suitable to be published as it currently stands. The comments of the reviewer(s) are included at the end of this email. Comments made directly on the manuscript are also attached in the email, if any. Therefore, I invite you to respond to the reviewer(s)’ comments and revise your manuscript.

Both reviewers gave you suggestions on how to improve the manuscript during revision. I recommend you carefully consider them, especially reviewer #2’s suggestion to rework on the abstract and results section, as the family names (Sonneratiaceae and Avicenniaceae) applied to some of the mangrove species are currently outdated. The incoherent referencing of the study locations throughout the text is also hard to follow, especially in Table 1 as pointed out by reviewer #2, and also Figure 2 that showed data for each location but the caption referred the location as “cluster”. I suggest you to justify the basis for grouping some of the study sites into a single cluster in the material and methods section, and at least mention in the caption of the tables and figures or revise them such that it is self-explanatory of how the sites are clustered to avoid confusion. Reviewer #2 also suggested you to include references which are more relevant to the assessment of mangrove rehabilitation in Indonesia to improve on your discussion. In addition, you should be careful with your choice of words so as not to overclaim the significance of the study. As reviewer #3 pointed out, your manuscript considered only the mangrove community structure of a restored forest, and therefore it is not so suitable to imply that the results of your study reflected the resilience of mangrove. Perhaps you could consider rephrasing the manuscript title to reflect the actual content of your study, as reviewer #3 suggested.

Please ensure that the list of reference follows the Harvard referencing style, which is in line

with the journal's specification. See the following examples of how various reference sources (e.g. journal articles, books, book chapters, conference proceedings, online resources, dissertations) should be formatted in the list of reference:

- [1] Kumar, P & Garde, RJ 1989, 'Potentials of water hyacinth for sewage treatment', Research Journal of Water Pollution Control Federation, vol. 30, no. 10, pp. 291–294.
- [2] Hyem, T & Kvale, O (eds) 1977, Physical, chemical and biological changes in food caused by thermal processing, 2 edn, Applied Science Publishers, London, UK.
- [3] Biale, JB 1975, 'Synthetic and degradative processes in fruit ripening', eds NF Hard & DK Salunkhe, in Post-harvest biology and handling of fruits and vegetables, AVI, Westport, CT, pp. 5–18.
- [4] Common, M 2001, 'The role of economics in natural heritage decision making', in Heritage economics: challenges for heritage conservation and sustainable development in the 21 century: Proceedings of the International Society for Ecological Economics Conference, Canberra, 4 July 2000, Australian Heritage Commission, Canberra.
- [5] Thomas, S 1997, Guide to personal efficiency, Adelaide University, viewed 6 January 2004, <<http://library.adelaide.edu.au/~stthomas/papers/perseff.html>>.
- [6] McColloch, LP, Cook, HT & Wright, WR 1968, Market diseases of tomatoes, peppers and egg-plants, Agriculture Handbook no. 28, United States Department of Agriculture, Washington, DC.
- [7] Cairns, RB 1965, 'Infrared spectroscopic studies of solid oxygen', PhD thesis, University of California, Berkeley, CA.

Attached with this email are the following files:

- (1) the manuscript you submitted (word file named "ASM_authname") for your own reference.
- (2) the manuscript file that has been formatted to ease the review process. The manuscript mainly has the line numbers added, made into single column and a line spacing of 1.5 (word file named "ASM-SI-ManuscriptID"). You are encouraged to **WORK ON THIS FILE** without formatting the page layout when revising your manuscript. You may also refer the line numbers quoted by reviewers to this word file.
- (3) the comments made directly on your manuscript by the reviewers (pdf files).
- (4) an author declaration form that you should send back to us along with the revised manuscript.

Kindly submit your revised manuscript by 9 August 2019. If your manuscript contains graphs and pictures, please send the source file(s) as well, for proofreading (spellcheck) and typesetting purpose.

PLEASE SUBMIT YOUR REVISED MANUSCRIPT BY REPLYING TO THIS EMAIL USING THE SAME SUBJECT LINE.

Thank you.

COMMENTS FOR THE AUTHORS:

Reviewer #2

Please see the comments below and also the specific comments made on the manuscript in the attached PDF file.

This work is to evaluate the mangrove rehabilitation in the study sites. Most parts of the manuscript need to be rewritten. Some articles reported the assessment of mangrove

rehabilitation in Indonesia; however most of them are not cited in this manuscript. The discussion section needs to be improved by referring to more relevant references.

Reviewer #3

Overall, the article is simply showing the study of mangrove community structure of planted 'restored' forest that does not reflect mangrove resilience. I did not see any data analysis in this manuscript that highlight the relationship between mangrove recovery with resilience. My assumption is that the authors wanted to discuss the succession of *Rhizophora* over other species in mangrove restoration sites by conducting mangrove community analysis. However, lack of methodology and limited language proficiency failed to support their argument.

In addition, there are many technical and language errors, indeed words layout, analysis and content also need to be improved. It seems that the authors submitted the manuscript in rush without having a proper proof-read or pre-review.

I suggest to reject this manuscript unless the major revision has been carried out, either change the title or elaborate the content with additional data.

Title:

My first criticism is the title, which is misleading and can raise many questions....what is the definition/parameter that a species can be classified as mangrove recovery's booster? Of course *Rhizophora* is the dominant species because it was the main species planted in the site. If the natural recruitment was undertaken in the site (no-plantation), I can say that the title is correct.

Abstract:

I do not agree this statement:

'The recovery of mangrove communities on the south coast of East Lombok explains the potential of *Rhizophoraceae* family for resilience of coastal ecosystems through mangrove replanting activity that has been done more than 25 years ago.'

Need to be careful with the word of 'coastal resilience'.

Figures and Table:

Figure 1 has to be improved with a common map format for journal article.

Table 1: make it clear and simple (not too colorful)

Discussion:

The discussion is too short. It is too early to jump into conclusion that the domination of *Rhizophora* implied to its role in mangrove resilience and conservation.

Sincerely,

Phaik-Eem Lim

Guest Editor

ASM Science Journal Special Issue of ICST2017

Paper Revision

abdul syukur <syukurbiologi@unram.ac.id> Sab, 10 Agu 2019 15.36

kepada icst2017.asm

I have finished the revision suggested by the reviewer,

so and thank you

Correspondent author

Abdul Syukur

Area lampiran



Phaik-Eem Lim <icst2017.asm@gmail.com> Sab, 10 Agu 2019 16.04

kepada saya

Dear Dr. Abdul Syukur,

I have received your revised manuscript. Attached is an author warranty form meant to be an official record for the manuscripts submitted through email for this special issue. We are currently in the reviewing process, but for formality purposes and to comply with the journal's requirement, please fill in and return the form to me.

I will get back to you regarding your revised manuscript as soon as possible. Thank you.

Sincerely,

Phaik-Eem Lim

Guest Editor

ASM Science Journal Special Issue of ICST2017

Decision on your manuscript ID ASM-SI-018.R1: Major revision required

Phaik-Eem Lim <icst2017.asm@gmail.com> Sel, 27 Agu 2019 14.59

kepada saya

Dear Dr. Abdul Syukur,

Thank you for submitting the revised manuscript ASM-SI-018.R1 entitled "The Evidence of Rhizophora as a Potential Species to improve Mangrove Recovery in The Coast of South East Lombok, Indonesia" to ASM Science Journal for the special issue of the 2nd International

Conference on Science and Technology in the Tropic (ICST2017).

I have reviewed your revised manuscript. The revised manuscript has provided slightly more context for the study in evaluating the development of the rehabilitated mangrove sites. However, there was not enough discussion or explanation on how the species diversity assessed at the mangrove sites (values of the species diversity and distribution indices) would indicate the recovery of the ecosystem since the replanting activities were carried out nearly 30 years ago. I also have concerns about the data and results presented, in particular. I urge you to go through all the results (tables and figures alike) you mentioned in the text and verify that they are correctly calculated/presented. See my comments in the Word file. In addition, please substitute a clearer figure for the study site map. I also made substantial editorial and language suggestions on your manuscript. Please check that I did not change your intended meaning of the text. Therefore, I invite you to respond to my comments and revise the manuscript by considering my suggestions.

Attached with this email are the following files:

- (1) the manuscript with my editorial and language suggestions and comments (word file named "ASM-SI-ManuscriptID.R1-Text-comment"). You are encouraged to WORK ON THIS FILE and HIGHLIGHT THE CHANGES YOU MADE WITH RED FONT when revising your manuscript.
- (2) an author warranty form that you should send back to us along with the revised manuscript. This is to ensure that the manuscript is original and has not been published or submitted elsewhere, in compliance with the journal's requirement.

Kindly submit your revised manuscript along with the author warranty form by 30 September 2019.

PLEASE SUBMIT YOUR REVISED MANUSCRIPT BY REPLYING TO THIS EMAIL USING THE SAME SUBJECT LINE.

Thank you.

Sincerely,
Phaik-Eem Lim
Guest Editor
ASM Science Journal Special Issue of ICST2017

abdul syukur <syukurbiologi@unram.ac.id> Sel, 1 Okt 2019 00.35

kepada icst2017.asm

I have finished the revision suggested by the reviewer,
so and thank you
Correspondent author

Decision on your manuscript ID ASM-SI-018.R2: Minor revision required

Phaik-Eem Lim <icst2017.asm@gmail.com> Kam, 10 Okt 2019 12.54

Dear Dr. Abdul Syukur,

Thank you for submitting the revised manuscript ASM-SI-018.R2 entitled “The Evidence of Rhizophora as a Potential Species to improve Mangrove Recovery in The Coast of South East Lombok, Indonesia” to ASM Science Journal for the special issue of the 2nd International Conference on Science and Technology in the Tropic (ICST2017).

I have reviewed your revised manuscript. The revised manuscript now reads better with updated results and more details and discussion provided. I made substantial editorial and language suggestions on your manuscript. The figures were also edited to revise some wordings. Please check that I did not change your intended meaning of the text. Before the manuscript can be accepted, I would need you to go through my comments to confirm some queries and provide some references for the part of discussion you newly added to the text (lines 187-197). With that, I invite you to respond to my comments and revise the manuscript by considering my suggestions.

Attached with this email is the manuscript with my editorial and language suggestions and comments (word file named “ASM-SI-ManuscriptID.R2-Text-comment”). You are encouraged to **WORK ON THIS FILE** and **HIGHLIGHT THE CHANGES YOU MADE WITH RED FONT** when revising your manuscript. In addition, please fill in the author warranty form with your name instead of the university’s name, and put your official stamp on it, in compliance with the journal’s requirement.

Kindly submit your revised manuscript along with the author warranty form by 16 October 2019.

PLEASE SUBMIT YOUR REVISED MANUSCRIPT BY REPLYING TO THIS EMAIL USING THE SAME SUBJECT LINE.

Thank you.

Sincerely,
Phaik-Eem Lim
Guest Editor
ASM Science Journal Special Issue of ICST2017

Decision on your manuscript ID ASM-SI-018.R3: Minor revision required

Phaik-Eem Lim <icst2017.asm@gmail.com> Sel, 29 Okt 2019 22.56

kepada saya

=====

Dear Dr. Abdul Syukur,

Thank you for submitting the revised manuscript ASM-SI-018.R3 entitled “The evidence of Rhizophora as a potential species to improve mangrove recovery on the southern coast of East Lombok, Indonesia” to ASM Science Journal for the special issue of the 2nd International Conference on Science and Technology in the Tropic (ICST2017).

I have reviewed your revised manuscript, and made some editorial suggestions in the text. Attached with this email is the manuscript with my editorial and language suggestions (word file named “ASM-SI-ManuscriptID.R3-Text-comment”). Please check if you agree with the suggestions before I can officially accept the manuscript.

Kindly reply to this email USING THE SAME SUBJECT LINE and clarify with me if there are parts that you disagree with by 31 October 2019.

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Phaik-Eem Lim

Guest Editor

ASM Science Journal Special Issue of ICST2017

Decision on your manuscript ID ASM-SI-018.R3: Accepted

Phaik-Eem Lim <icst2017.asm@gmail.com> Jum, 1 Nov 2019 13.10

kepada saya

Dear Dr. Abdul Syukur,

I am pleased to inform that your revised manuscript ASM-SI-018.R3 entitled “The evidence of Rhizophora as a potential species to improve mangrove recovery on the southern coast of East Lombok, Indonesia” has been accepted for publication in the ASM Science Journal for the special issue of the 2nd International Conference on Science and Technology in the Tropic (ICST2017).

Your manuscript is now proceeded to copyediting and proof production. We will be in contact with you if we need any further information. You may write to me at this address if you have any questions regarding this manuscript by quoting the manuscript ID ASM-SI-018.R3 in the subject title.

Thank you very much for this interesting contribution.

Sincerely,

Phaik-Eem Lim

Guest Editor

ASM Science Journal Special Issue of ICST2017

proof correction

abdul syukur <syukurbiologi@unram.ac.id> Sel, 31 Mar 2020 11.40

kepada Phaik-Eem

Sorry there was a mistake in the first one and the correct one is the one I posted the latest. I have checked the addresses of all the author's institutions and I have made corrections, such as the writing of the University of Mataram changed to Mataram University and the Address for the second I have corrected, as below. However, if it cannot be changed, I accept all decisions from the ASM editor.

1 Department of Sciences Education, Faculty of Teacher Training and Education, Mataram University, Jalan Majapahit 62, Mataram, West Nusa Tenggara 83125, Indonesia

2. Department of Postgraduate Science Education, Mataram University, Jalan Majapahit 37 Mataram, West Nusa Tenggara 83114 Indonesia

Greetings

Abdul Syukur
Correspondent author

Phaik-Eem Lim <icst2017.asm@gmail.com> Rab, 1 Apr 2020 08.31

kepada saya

Dear Author,

Please note that the name of the university will be standardised to University of Mataram.

The second affiliation (with changes to the street name and postcode) will be updated to the following

2. Department of Postgraduate Science Education, University of Mataram, Jalan Majapahit 37, Mataram, West Nusa Tenggara 83114, Indonesia

Thank you.

Sincerely,
Phaik-Eem Lim
Guest Editor
ASM Science Journal Special Issue of ICST2017

**[Update] Proof for your article in the Special Issue of
ASM Science Journal, manuscript number ASM-SI-
018.R3**

Eksternal

Phaik-Eem Lim <icst2017.asm@gmail.com> 13 Apr 2021 23.15

abdul syukur <syukurbiologi@unram.ac.id> 15 Apr 2021 21.11

kepada Phaik-Eem

Thank you for the information about the publication of our paper with the topic "The Evidence of Rhizophora as a Potential Species to Improve Mangrove Recovery on the Southern Coast of East Lombok, Indonesia". After I read the recommended session, there were no changes or I agreed with proofreading the pdf file that was sent.

Best regards

author

Abdul Syukur

Phaik-Eem Lim <icst2017.asm@gmail.com> 19 Apr 2021 09.57

abdul syukur <syukurbiologi@unram.ac.id> 20 Apr 2021 11.13

kepada Phaik-Eem

I sent the copyright required by the ASM Journal, and attached files

Best regards

author

Abdul Syukur

Phaik-Eem Lim <icst2017.asm@gmail.com> 20 Apr 2021 22.43

kepada saya

Dear Author,

Please fill in the date and leave the "Ref" field empty at the beginning of the agreement. Also, put your name (corresponding author's name) instead of the institution's name in the agreement.

Thank you.

Sincerely,
Phaik-Eem Lim
Guest Editor
ASM Science Journal Special Issue of ICST2017

abdul syukur <syukurbiologi@unram.ac.id> 21 Apr 2021 10.13

kepada Phaik-Eem

I send the revised results copyright required by the ASM Journal, and attached files

Best regards
author

Abdul Syukur

abdul syukur <syukurbiologi@unram.ac.id> 10 Jul 2021 10.27

kepada Phaik-Eem

Sincerely, I am the author of the special issue volume 14 no 2, and have been given the proof of publication as in the attachment below. However, the ASM journal web cannot be opened, hopefully the information can be provided. That's it and thank you