BUKTI KORESPONDENSI
ARTIKEL JURNAL INTERNATIONAL BEREPUTASI

Judul Artikel : The Growth of Drumstick (*Moringa oleifera* Lam.) Seedling under Artificial Shade and their Early Growth after Transplanting
Jurnal : Universal Journal of Agricultural Research, Vol 11, No. 3. June, 2023
Link : https://www.hrpub.org/journals/article_info.php?aid=13376
Penulis : Dr. Ir. Bambang Budi Santoso, M.Sc.Agr.

No.	Perihal	Tanggal
1.	Mempersiapkan manuskrip sesuai template jurnal	Maret 2023
2.	Submit artikel ke Universal Journal of Agricultural Research dan bukti artikel yang disubmit	5 April 2023
3.	Koresponden melalui Online Submission Jurnal (History Record). (revision.hrpub@gmail.com) – **Initial Screening**. Menginformasikan kode naskah/manuscript – ID:10433191	9 April 2023
4.	Koresponden melaluin Online Submission (History Record). Your manuscript (ID:10433191) meets the general criteria for the journal and has been sent out for peer review. Usually, it takes 50 days or so to complete the peer review. Under Peer Review	13 April 2023
5.	Email dari Universal Journal of Agricultural Research. Isi email secara garis besar: menginformasikan Manuscript Status Update On (ID: 10433191): Current Status – Under Peer Review. Perlunya merevisi tata saji referensi, dan selanjutnya korespondensi dilanjutkan oleh Anthony Robinson (revision.hrpub@gmail.com).	17 April 2023
6.	Email dari Universal Journal of Agricultural Research. Isi email secara garis besar: Revision Requested Mengirimkan hasil review dari dari dua orang reviewer (2 peer reviewers) untuk dilakukan revisi.	12 Mei 2023
7.	Mengirim email ke Universal Journal of Agricultural Research.	16 Mei 2023

	Berisikan (mengirm) hasil revisi atas review 2 orang reviewers. Selain naskah hasil revisi, dikirmkan juga Cover Letter, Plagiarism Check, dan Publication Agreement.	
8.	Email dari Universal Journal of Agricultural Research Isi email secara garis besar: Universal Journal of Agricultural Research. Telah menerima naskah hasil revisi kami, dan meminta kami menunggu sampai review berikut selesai.	17 Mei 2023
9.	Email dari Universal Journal of Agricultural Research. Isi email secara garis besar: Ready for Acceptance Naskah/paper kami dapat diterima untuk dipublikasi. Dikirmkan surat keterangan Acceptance Letter Kami diminta melakukan pembayaran dalam kurung waktu 2 minggu ke depan.	30 Mei 2023
10.	Mengirim email ke Universal Journal of Agricultural Research. Menyertakan bukti pembayaran penerbitan naskah kami.	7 Juni 2023
11.	Mengirim email ke Universal Journal of Agricultural Research. Kami menanyakan kapan penerbitan atas naskah kami.	12 Juni 2023
12.	Email dari Universal Journal of Agricultural Research. Isi email secara garis besar: menyampaikan bahwa naskah kami dalam masa editing dan akan dipublish pada akhir bulan Juni – Vol 11, Nomor 3.	13 Juni 2023
13.	Email dari Universal Journal of Agricultural Research. Isi email secara garis besar: Naskah kami sudah diterima/siap untuk dipublikasi. Diperlukan Proof Reading oleh kami sebagai author. Kami menerima naskah kami dalam format siap terbit.	15 Juni 2023
14.	Mengirim email ke Universal Journal of Agricultural Research. Isinya mengirm balik naskah kami yang sudah kami lakukan proof reading. Disertai beberapa koreksi dan tambahan penting.	16 Juni 2023
15.	Email dari Universal Journal of Agricultural Research. Isi email secara garis besar: telah menerima naskah final (final version) kami	19 Juni 2023

16.	Email dari Universal Journal of Agricultural Research. Isi email secara garis besar: menginformasikan bahwa naskah kami telah diterbitkan pada Universal Journal of Agricultural Research, Vol.11, No. 3, Juni 2023.	3 Juli 2023

Mataram, 8 Juli 2023

Bambang Budi Santoso

Bambang Budi Santoso <bambang.bs@unram.ac.id>

Manuscript Status Update On (ID: 10433191): Current Status – Under Peer Review- The Growth of Drumstick (Moringa oleifera Lam.) Seedling Under Artificial Shade and Their Early Growth After Transplanting

Chloe Crawford <preview.hrpub@gmail.com> 17 April 2023 pukul 16.17
Kepada: bambang.bs@unram.ac.id

Dear Bambang Budi Santoso,

Thank you very much for submitting your manuscript to HRPUB.
In order to expedite the publication process, your manuscript entitled "The Growth of Drumstick (Moringa oleifera Lam.) Seedling Under Artificial Shade and Their Early Growth After Transplanting" has been sent out to evaluate.
But some problems need to be addressed.
We would be grateful to you if you could revise your manuscript according to the following comments:
1. The format of the list of REFERENCES is not in accordance with the journal's rules. Please check all references for completeness and accuracy, including author names, paper title, journal heading, Volume, Number., pages for journal citations, Year, DOI (or URL if possible). (Please note that the DOI should be placed after the URL and end with a period.)
Journals
All author names, "Title," Journal title, vol., no., pp. xxx–xxx., Year, DOI (or URL)
e.g.
[1] Clarke A., Mike F., S. Mary, "The Use of Technology in Education," Universal Journal of Educational Research, vol. 1, no. 1, pp. 1–10, 2015. DOI: 10.13189/ujer.2015.010829
Books
All author names, "Title of chapter in the book," in Title of the Published Book, (xth ed. if possible), Abbrev. of Publisher, Year, pp. xxx–xxx.
e.g.
[1] Tom B, Jack E, R. Voss, "The Current Situation of Education," in Current Situation and Development of Contemporary Education, 1st ed, HRPUB, 2013, pp. 1-200.
Conference Papers
All author names, "Title," Conference title, (location of conference is optional), (Month and day(s) if provided) Year, pp., (DOI or URL, if possible)
e.g.
[1] David H., Tim P., "The Use of Technology in Teaching," The Third International Conference, LA, USA, Jul., 2013, pp. 19-23. (The year may be omitted if it has been given in the conference title) (DOI or URL, if possible).
Websites
All author names, "Page Title." Website Title. Web Address (retrieved Date Accessed).
e.g.
[1] Partson K., Joe L., "The Use of Technology in Teaching", US News, http://www.hrpub.com (accessed Jan. 1, 2013).

Please find the following paper for your reference.
https://www.hrpub.org/download/20210330/SAJ22-19922645.pdf

***Please highlight the changes you have made.**

Kindly respond to the evaluation and send your revised manuscript to preview.hrpub@gmail.com as soon as possible.
Please track status of your manuscript through the Online Manuscript Tracking System.

We will contact you again once a new decision is made on your manuscript. You will expect a review report from Anthony Robinson (revision.hrpub@gmail.com) in the following 45 days. Peer review reports are also downloadable in Online Manuscript Tracking System (http://www.hrpub.org/submission/login.php) once the review process is completed.

The author will be requested to pay the Article Processing Charges after the manuscript is accepted for publication.
For the charging standard, please refer to http://www.hrpub.org/journals/jour_charge.php?id=04

Please feel free to contact us if you have any questions. Besides, could you please leave us an alternate Email Address in case?

For more information, please visit the journal's homepage.

Guidelines: http://www.hrpub.org/journals/jour_guidelines.php?id=04

Please acknowledge receipt of this email.

Best Regards

Chloe Crawford
Editorial Assistant
preview.hrpub@gmail.com
Horizon Research Publishing, USA
http://www.hrpub.org

Bambang Budi Santoso <bambang.bs@unram.ac.id>

Revision after Peer Review (ID:10433191)-2 reports-The Growth of Drumstick (Moringa oleifera Lam.) Seedling under Artificial Shade and their Early Growth after Transplanting

3 pesan

Anthony Robinson <revision.hrpub@gmail.com> 12 Mei 2023 pukul 17.48
Kepada: bambang.bs@unram.ac.id

Dear Bambang Budi Santoso,

Thank you for your interest in publishing your work in HRPUB.

Your manuscript has now been peer reviewed and the comments are accessible in Word format.

Usually, we invite 2 peer reviewers for one manuscript. Compared with both review reports, the overlapped parts can be ignored.
Please confirm all comments from the two reviewers have been effected in your paper.

We would be grateful if you could address the comments of the reviewers in a revised manuscript and answer all questions raised by reviewers in a cover letter. Any revision should be made on the attached manuscript.

Note:
1. In addition to necessary revisions, please note that the similarity index of the revised version should be lower than 18% and similarity from a single source should not exceed 5%.

2. Based on the theme of your manuscript, we would like to recommend the following published articles for your reference. If it is useful in enriching your manuscript, you can cite them in your manuscript. If not, just ignore it.
Identification and in vitro Characterization of Plant Growth-promoting Pseudomonas spp. Isolated from the Rhizosphere of Tomato (Lycopersicum esculentum) Plants in Kenya https://doi.org/10.13189/ujar.2022.100608
Morphological Characteristics of Abaca (Musa textilis Nee') Cultivars Grown in Two Municipalities of Aklan, Philippines https://doi.org/10.13189/ujar.2022.100209

Please download the publication agreement (http://www.hrpub.org/download/HRPUB_Publication_Agreement2023.pdf) and fill in the authors' names, manuscript title, manuscript ID and signature, then send a scanned version to us.

Please submit the revised paper to us by email in MS Word or LaTex format within two weeks and do not submit it into the Online Manuscript Tracking System.

The author will be requested to pay the Article Processing Charges after the manuscript is accepted for publication. For the charging standard, please refer to http://www.hrpub.org/journals/jour_charge.php?id=04

Look forward to receiving your revised manuscript as soon as possible.

Please acknowledge receipt of this email.

Best Regards

Anthony Robinson
Editorial Assistant
revision.hrpub@gmail.com
Horizon Research Publishing, USA
http://www.hrpub.org

4 lampiran

Peer_Review_Report-10433191_1.docx
59K

Peer_Review_Report-10433191_2.docx
58K

UJAR-10433191_checked by referee_1.pdf
167K

UJAR-10433191.doc
123K

Bambang Budi Santoso <bambang.bs@unram.ac.id> 16 Mei 2023 pukul 14.24
Kepada: Anthony Robinson <revision.hrpub@gmail.com>

Dear **Anthony Robinson**

Related to my article with ID 10433191 entitled **The Growth of Drumstick (*Moringa oleifera* Lam.) Seedling under Artificial Shade and their Early Growth after Transplanting**, we attach:

1. Articles/manuscripts have been revised. The revision was made based on the review of the two reviewers. In this revised article has also been added (enrichment), one of which is the recommended article in particular from **Gene T. Seneris et al. 2022**.
2. Cover letter
3. Plagiarism check
4. Publication Agreement

I hope after revising this article, it could be a worthy article to be published in your journal.
Thanks for your attention.

Best regard,

Bambang Budi Santoso

Pada tanggal Jum, 12 Mei 2023 pukul 17.49 Anthony Robinson <revision.hrpub@gmail.com> menulis:

> Dear Bambang Budi Santoso,
>
> Thank you for your interest in publishing your work in HRPUB.
>
> Your manuscript has now been peer reviewed and the comments are accessible in Word format.
>
> Usually, we invite 2 peer reviewers for one manuscript. Compared with both review reports, the overlapped parts can be ignored.
> Please confirm all comments from the two reviewers have been effected in your paper.
>
> We would be grateful if you could address the comments of the reviewers in a revised manuscript and answer all questions raised by reviewers in a cover letter. Any revision should be made on the attached manuscript.
>
> **Note:**
> **1. In addition to necessary revisions, please note that the similarity index of the revised version should be lower than 18% and similarity from a single source should not exceed 5%.**
>
> **2. Based on the theme of your manuscript, we would like to recommend the following published articles for your reference. If it is useful in enriching your manuscript, you can cite them in your manuscript. If not, just ignore it.**
> **Identification and in vitro Characterization of Plant Growth-promoting Pseudomonas spp. Isolated from the Rhizosphere of Tomato (Lycopersicum esculentum) Plants in Kenya https://doi.org/10.13189/ujar.2022.100608**
> **Morphological Characteristics of Abaca (Musa textilis Nee') Cultivars Grown in Two Municipalities of Aklan, Philippines https://doi.org/10.13189/ujar.2022.100209**
>
> Please download the publication agreement (http://www.hrpub.org/download/HRPUB_Publication_Agreement2023.pdf) and fill in the authors' names, manuscript title, manuscript ID and signature, then send a scanned version to us.
>
> Please submit the revised paper to us by email in MS Word or LaTex format within two weeks and do not submit it into the Online Manuscript Tracking System.
>
> The author will be requested to pay the Article Processing Charges after the manuscript is accepted for publication. For the charging standard, please refer to http://www.hrpub.org/journals/jour_charge.php?id=04
>
> Look forward to receiving your revised manuscript as soon as possible.
>
> **Please acknowledge receipt of this email.**
>
> Best Regards
>
> Anthony Robinson
> Editorial Assistant

revision.hrpub@gmail.com
Horizon Research Publishing, USA
http://www.hrpub.org

--
Regards,

Dr. Ir. Bambang Budi Santoso, MSc.Agr.
Agroekoteknologi, Fakultas Pertanian, Universitas Mataram.
Jln. Majapahit 62, Mataram. LOMBOK (NTB) - INDONESIA

4 lampiran

UJAR-10433191-revised.doc
128K

HRPUB Publication Agreement2023-ID 10433191-Scanned.pdf
896K

Turnitin-The Growth of Drumstick (Moringa oleifera Lam.) Seedling under Artificial Shade and their Early Growth after Transplanting.pdf
1947K

COVER LETTER-The Growth of Drumstick (Moringa oleifera Lam.) Seedling under Artificial Shade.docx
20K

Anthony Robinson <revision.hrpub@gmail.com> 17 Mei 2023 pukul 09.18
Kepada: Bambang Budi Santoso <bambang.bs@unram.ac.id>

Dear Bambang Budi Santoso,

Thank you for your kind email.
We have received your revised paper and other related documents.
If further revision is not required, you will expect an Acceptance Letter from us in two weeks.

Best Regards

Anthony Robinson
Editorial Assistant
revision.hrpub@gmail.com
Horizon Research Publishing, USA
http://www.hrpub.org

On Tue, May 16, 2023 at 2:25 PM Bambang Budi Santoso <bambang.bs@unram.ac.id> wrote:

Dear **Anthony Robinson**

Related to my article with ID 10433191 entitled **The Growth of Drumstick (*Moringa oleifera* Lam.) Seedling under Artificial Shade and their Early Growth after Transplanting**, we attach:

1. Articles/manuscripts have been revised. The revision was made based on the review of the two reviewers. In this revised article has also been added (enrichment), one of which is the recommended article in particular from **Gene T. Seneris et al. 2022**.
2. Cover letter
3. Plagiarism check
4. Publication Agreement

I hope after revising this article, it could be a worthy article to be published in your journal.
Thanks for your attention.

Best regard,

Bambang Budi Santoso

Pada tanggal Jum, 12 Mei 2023 pukul 17.49 Anthony Robinson <revision.hrpub@gmail.com> menulis:

Dear Bambang Budi Santoso,

Thank you for your interest in publishing your work in HRPUB.

Your manuscript has now been peer reviewed and the comments are accessible in Word format.

Usually, we invite 2 peer reviewers for one manuscript. Compared with both review reports, the overlapped parts can be ignored.
Please confirm all comments from the two reviewers have been effected in your paper.

We would be grateful if you could address the comments of the reviewers in a revised manuscript and answer all questions raised by reviewers in a cover letter. Any revision should be made on the attached manuscript.

Note:
1. In addition to necessary revisions, please note that the similarity index of the revised version should be lower than 18% and similarity from a single source should not exceed 5%.

2. Based on the theme of your manuscript, we would like to recommend the following published articles for your reference. If it is useful in enriching your manuscript, you can cite them in your manuscript. If not, just ignore it.
Identification and in vitro Characterization of Plant Growth-promoting Pseudomonas spp. Isolated from the Rhizosphere of Tomato (Lycopersicum esculentum) Plants in Kenya https://doi.org/10.13189/ujar.2022.100608
Morphological Characteristics of Abaca (Musa textilis Nee') Cultivars Grown in Two Municipalities of Aklan, Philippines https://doi.org/10.13189/ujar.2022.100209

Please download the publication agreement (http://www.hrpub.org/download/HRPUB_Publication_Agreement2023.pdf) and fill in the authors' names, manuscript title, manuscript ID and signature, then send a scanned version to us.

Please submit the revised paper to us by email in MS Word or LaTex format within two weeks and do not submit it into the Online Manuscript Tracking System.

The author will be requested to pay the Article Processing Charges after the manuscript is accepted for publication. For the charging standard, please refer to http://www.hrpub.org/journals/jour_charge.php?id=04

Look forward to receiving your revised manuscript as soon as possible.

Please acknowledge receipt of this email.

Best Regards

Anthony Robinson
Editorial Assistant
revision.hrpub@gmail.com
Horizon Research Publishing, USA
http://www.hrpub.org

--
Regards,

Dr. Ir. Bambang Budi Santoso, MSc.Agr.
Agroekoteknologi, Fakultas Pertanian, Universitas Mataram.
Jln. Majapahit 62, Mataram. LOMBOK (NTB) - INDONESIA

Acceptance Letter & Advice of Payment (ID:10433191)-The Growth of Drumstick (Moringa oleifera Lam.) Seedling under Artificial Shade and their Early Growth after Transplanting

5 pesan

Anthony Robinson <revision.hrpub@gmail.com> 30 Mei 2023 pukul 20.42
Kepada: Bambang Budi Santoso <bambang.bs@unram.ac.id>

Dear Bambang Budi Santoso,

Your paper has been accepted for publication. Herewith attached is the Acceptance Letter.

The publication fee is $480. Below are Wire Transfer instructions.

Beneficiary name: HORIZON RESEARCH PUBLISHING CO., LTD
Beneficiary account number: 33113742
Banking Swift code for international wires: CATHUS6L
Beneficiary bank name: Cathay Bank
Beneficiary bank address: 4128 Temple City Blvd, Rosemead, CA 91770 United States
Note: Please add $35.00 for wire transfer fee.

The bank charge would be deducted prior to the receipt of the payment. To avoid a shortfall on the net amount received and request for repayment, authors shall pay the commission charge while making the payment.

Once the payment is finished, please inform us or send the remittance bill to us.

Best Regards

Anthony Robinson
Editorial Assistant
revision.hrpub@gmail.com
Horizon Research Publishing, USA
http://www.hrpub.org

Acceptance Letter_10433191.jpg
259K

Bambang Budi Santoso <bambang.bs@unram.ac.id> 7 Juni 2023 pukul 10.25
Kepada: Anthony Robinson <revision.hrpub@gmail.com>

Dear Anthony Robinson

We attach proof of payment on the article with ID 10433191.
Thank you for the opportunity to publish our article in your journal.

Best Regard
[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]
--
Regards,

Dr. Ir. Bambang Budi Santoso, MSc.Agr.
Agroekoteknologi, Fakultas Pertanian, Universitas Mataram.

Jln. Majapahit 62, Mataram. LOMBOK (NTB) - INDONESIA

payment ID 10433191.jpeg
39K

Anthony Robinson <revision.hrpub@gmail.com> 7 Juni 2023 pukul 17.10
Kepada: Bambang Budi Santoso <bambang.bs@unram.ac.id>

Dear Bambang Budi Santoso,

Thank you for your interest in publishing your work in HRPUB.
We have received your payment. No worry.

Best Regards

Anthony Robinson
Editorial Assistant
revision.hrpub@gmail.com
Horizon Research Publishing, USA
http://www.hrpub.org

[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]

Bambang Budi Santoso <bambang.bs@unram.ac.id> 12 Juni 2023 pukul 15.33
Kepada: Anthony Robinson <revision.hrpub@gmail.com>

Dear Anthony Robinson,

Are there any problems that we need to resolve, in relation to the unpublished to date of our article with ID 10433191.
Please let us know if there is something we need to fix.

Best Regards.
Bambang Budi Santoso
[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]

Anthony Robinson <revision.hrpub@gmail.com> 13 Juni 2023 pukul 14.10
Kepada: Bambang Budi Santoso <bambang.bs@unram.ac.id>

Dear Bambang Budi Santoso,

Your paper will be published at the end of this month.
The edited version will be sent to you for checking once it is ready.

Best Regards

Anthony Robinson
Editorial Assistant
revision.hrpub@gmail.com
Horizon Research Publishing, USA
http://www.hrpub.org

[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]

Proof Reading before Publication (ID:10433191)-The Growth of Drumstick (Moringa oleifera Lam.) Seedling under Artificial Shade and their Early Growth after Transplanting

4 pesan

Anthony Robinson <revision.hrpub@gmail.com> 15 Juni 2023 pukul 13.55
Kepada: Bambang Budi Santoso <bambang.bs@unram.ac.id>

Dear Bambang Budi Santoso,

Your manuscript has been accepted for publication. Authors are given a chance of checking the attached manuscript before publication. If we don't receive any confirmation or feedback of the manuscript before 06/18/2023, it will be regarded as the final version.

Note: Please carefully check the whole manuscript to ensure consistency and accuracy in grammar, spelling, punctuation and formatting, especially those highlighted parts proofread by our team.

All revisions should be made and highlighted on the attached manuscript.

Kindly note that the paper title, author names and affiliations shall not be modified once the paper is published.

Best Regards

Anthony Robinson
Editorial Assistant
revision.hrpub@gmail.com
Horizon Research Publishing, USA
http://www.hrpub.org

10433191.docx
62K

Bambang Budi Santoso <bambang.bs@unram.ac.id> 16 Juni 2023 pukul 15.05
Kepada: Anthony Robinson <revision.hrpub@gmail.com>

Dear Anthony Robinson

The last version of the article we received, we have read and checked. We are agree with the correction. Thank you for the opportunity to publish our script in your journal.

Best Regards
Bambang Budi Santoso
[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]
--
Regards,

Dr. Ir. Bambang Budi Santoso, MSc.Agr.
Agroekoteknologi, Fakultas Pertanian, Universitas Mataram.
Jln. Majapahit 62, Mataram. LOMBOK (NTB) - INDONESIA

10433191 - checked.docx
62K

Anthony Robinson <revision.hrpub@gmail.com> 19 Juni 2023 pukul 08.48
Kepada: Bambang Budi Santoso <bambang.bs@unram.ac.id>

Dear Bambang Budi Santoso,

Thank you for your email.
We have received the final version of your paper.

Best Regards

Anthony Robinson
Editorial Assistant
revision.hrpub@gmail.com
Horizon Research Publishing, USA
http://www.hrpub.org

[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]

Bambang Budi Santoso <bambang.bs@unram.ac.id> 22 Juni 2023 pukul 09.09
Kepada: Anthony Robinson <revision.hrpub@gmail.com>

Thank you for your information.
[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]

Publication (ID:10433191)-The Growth of Drumstick (Moringa oleifera Lam.) Seedling under Artificial Shade and their Early Growth after Transplanting

3 pesan

Bambang Budi Santoso <bambang.bs@unram.ac.id> 30 Juni 2023 pukul 10.15
Kepada: Anthony Robinson <revision.hrpub@gmail.com>

Dear Anthony Robinson

Please apologize in advance, in relation with the administration requirement for the publication of our articles before July 2023, and if possible, we ask that our articles may be published when there are no other requirements that we need to meet. If we do, we will soon be filled.

Sincerely
Bambang Budi Santoso

--
Regards,

Dr. Ir. Bambang Budi Santoso, MSc.Agr.
Agroekoteknologi, Fakultas Pertanian, Universitas Mataram.
Jln. Majapahit 62, Mataram. LOMBOK (NTB) - INDONESIA

Anthony Robinson <revision.hrpub@gmail.com> 3 Juli 2023 pukul 10.38
Kepada: Bambang Budi Santoso <bambang.bs@unram.ac.id>

Dear Bambang Budi Santoso,

We are pleased to inform you that your paper has been published. Please refer to the following information for detail:

PAPER_TITLE: The Growth of Drumstick (Moringa oleifera Lam.) Seedling under Artificial Shade and their Early Growth after Transplanting
ARTICLE_INFO: https://www.hrpub.org/journals/article_info.php?aid=13376
Download Info: https://www.hrpub.org/download/20230630/UJAR14-10433191.pdf

Please feel free to contact us if you have any questions.

Best Regards

Anthony Robinson
Editorial Assistant
revision.hrpub@gmail.com
Horizon Research Publishing, USA
http://www.hrpub.org

On Fri, Jun 30, 2023 at 10:15 AM Bambang Budi Santoso <bambang.bs@unram.ac.id> wrote:

> Dear Anthony Robinson
>
> Please apologize in advance, in relation with the administration requirement for the publication of our articles before July 2023, and if possible, we ask that our articles may be published when there are no other requirements that we need to meet. If we do, we will soon be filled.
>
> Sincerely
> Bambang Budi Santoso
>
> --
> Regards,
>
> **Dr. Ir. Bambang Budi Santoso, MSc.Agr.**

Agroekoteknologi, Fakultas Pertanian, Universitas Mataram.
Jln. Majapahit 62, Mataram. LOMBOK (NTB) - INDONESIA

Bambang Budi Santoso <bambang.bs@unram.ac.id> 3 Juli 2023 pukul 12.04
Kepada: Anthony Robinson <revision.hrpub@gmail.com>

Dear Anthony Robinson
Thank you so much for the great news!
Sincerely yours

On Mon, Jul 3, 2023, 10:38 Anthony Robinson <revision.hrpub@gmail.com> wrote:

> Dear Bambang Budi Santoso,
>
> We are pleased to inform you that your paper has been published. Please refer to the following information for detail:
>
> PAPER_TITLE: The Growth of Drumstick (Moringa oleifera Lam.) Seedling under Artificial Shade and their Early Growth after Transplanting
> ARTICLE_INFO: https://www.hrpub.org/journals/article_info.php?aid=13376
> Download Info: https://www.hrpub.org/download/20230630/UJAR14-10433191.pdf
>
> Please feel free to contact us if you have any questions.
>
> Best Regards
>
> Anthony Robinson
> Editorial Assistant
> revision.hrpub@gmail.com
> Horizon Research Publishing, USA
> http://www.hrpub.org
>
> On Fri, Jun 30, 2023 at 10:15 AM Bambang Budi Santoso <bambang.bs@unram.ac.id> wrote:
>
> > Dear Anthony Robinson
> >
> > Please apologize in advance, in relation with the administration requirement for the publication of our articles before July 2023, and if possible, we ask that our articles may be published when there are no other requirements that we need to meet. If we do, we will soon be filled.
> >
> > Sincerely
> > Bambang Budi Santoso
> >
> > --
> > Regards,
> >
> > **Dr. Ir. Bambang Budi Santoso, MSc.Agr.**
> > Agroekoteknologi, Fakultas Pertanian, Universitas Mataram.
> > *Jln. Majapahit 62, Mataram. LOMBOK (NTB) - INDONESIA*

Horizon Research Publishing Corporation

View / Edit My Manuscript

Journal Title

Universal Journal of Agricultural Research

Manuscript Title

The Growth of Drumstick (Moringa oleifera Lam.) Seedling Under Artificial Shade and Their Early Growth After Transplanting

Abstract

Currently, Moringa oleifera multipurpose plant has become an important crop in the agro-industrial sector. In nursery propagation, suitable environmental conditions such irradiation is needed for the growth of seedlings. Modifying the sunlight intensity through setting the shade is an important thing must be considered. This study consisted of three experiments. The first and the second were carried out using black paranet shading, e.g. 90% shading (105.13 lux) using three layers of paranet; 65% shading (387.61 lux) using two layers of paranet; 35% shading (787.96 lux) using one layer of paranet, and without paranet shading (1,479.23 lux) for test the seed viability with five replications, and each replication consisted of 100 seeds, and test the seedlings growth with five replications, and each replication consisted of fifteen seedlings series. Third, an experiment to test the adaptability of seedlings from the second experiment to the production field, through the grid system planting method which was repeated three times and each replication consisted of 10 seedlings. The results showed that the level of shade had a significant effect on seed viability, seedling growth, and early adaptability of seedlings in the production field. The best quality Moringa seedlings could be obtained by application of artificial shade using one layer of black paranet with a shade level of 35% (787.96 lux).

Keywords

adaptation, intensity, environment, light, paranet

History Records

Date	Latest Status	Editor Comment
2023-07-04	Final Publication	Your manuscript has been published and the electronic version is available online.
2023-06-25	Accepted for Publication	
2023-06-05	Ready for Acceptance	Your manuscript will be accepted for publication. Please complete the payment following the Payment Instructions sent by Anthony Robinson (revision.hrpub@gmail.com) within 2 weeks.
2023-05-24	Revision Requested	The review report of your paper has been sent to your mailbox. If you fail to receive it, please contact Anthony Robinson (revision.hrpub@gmail.com). Or you can download the report by clicking the "Review Report(s)" at the right column. Please

		send the revised paper to Anthony Robinson.
2023-04-13	Under Peer Review	Your manuscript meets the general criteria for the journal and has been sent out for peer review. Usually, it takes 50 days or so to complete the peer review. The report will be sent to you by Anthony Robinson (revision.hrpub@gmail.com). Report is also downloadable by clicking the "Review Report(s)" at the right column.
2023-04-09	Initial Screening	Your manuscript has been assigned to editors for initial screening. The outcome of initial screening will be sent to you by Chloe Crawford (preview.hrpub@gmail.com) within 7 business days.
2023-04-05	Submit Success	

Author Feedback

Submit Cancel

ON LINE SUBMISSION

Horizon Research Publishing Corporation

Peer Review Report

Notes

Please return the completed report by email within 21 days;

About HRPUB

Horizon Research Publishing, USA (HRPUB) is a worldwide open access publisher serving the academic research and scientific communities by launching peer-reviewed journals covering a wide range of academic disciplines. As an international academic organization for researchers & scientists, we aim to provide researchers, writers, academic professors and students the most advanced research achievements in a broad range of areas, and to facilitate the academic exchange between them.

Manuscript Information

Manuscript ID:	**10433191**
Manuscript Title:	**The Growth of Drumstick (*Moringa oleifera* Lam.) Seedling under Artificial Shade and their Early Growth after Transplanting**

Evaluation Report

General Comments	The research work although is in preliminary level and is presented clearly. The results are quite explicable. Overall, the results represented in the manuscript will offer additional information to the researchers in the studied area. Introduction gave the appropriate informarion. I recommend the publication. It would be more useful for other scientist and farmers if the author could improve furtherly the manuscript.
Advantage & Disadvantage	clear results Poor results
How to improve	You could add ore references Use italics for latin names

Please rate the following: (1 = Excellent) (2 = Good) (3 = Fair) (4 = Poor)

Originality:	2
Contribution to the Field:	3
Technical Quality:	3
Clarity of Presentation :	3
Depth of Research:	4

Recommendation	
Kindly mark with a ■	
☐ Accept As It Is	
x Requires Minor Revision	
☐ Requires Major Revision	
☐ Reject	

Return Date: _____

Peer Review Report

Notes

Please return the completed report by email within 21 days;

About HRPUB

Horizon Research Publishing, USA (HRPUB) is a worldwide open access publisher serving the academic research and scientific communities by launching peer-reviewed journals covering a wide range of academic disciplines. As an international academic organization for researchers & scientists, we aim to provide researchers, writers, academic professors and students the most advanced research achievements in a broad range of areas, and to facilitate the academic exchange between them.

Manuscript Information

Manuscript ID:	**10433191**
Manuscript Title:	**The Growth of Drumstick (*Moringa oleifera* Lam.) Seedling under Artificial Shade and their Early Growth after Transplanting**

Evaluation Report

General Comments	The research carried out by the author is intended to achieve the understanding of the behavior of the *Moringa oleifera* species in relation to the amount of light provided (or in other words, the intensity of light) both during the germination process of the seeds and during the growth of the seedlings. Moreover, the author also studied the effects of light intensity after transplanting the seedlings.
Advantage & Disadvantage	This study demonstrated the necessity to assure of this species the most adequate light amount which will have as a result, the high plants quality. Besides, the high-quality seedlings obtained using the proper artificial shading offer a better plants growth and development in the field where the same shading conditions have been assured.

How to improve	I appreciate that some interventions are necessary to be clearer for the reader. The observations and recommendations have been done on the manuscript.

Please rate the following: (1 = Excellent) (2 = Good) (3 = Fair) (4 = Poor)	
Originality:	3
Contribution to the Field:	2
Technical Quality:	2
Clarity of Presentation :	2
Depth of Research:	3

Recommendation

Kindly mark with a ■

☐ Accept As It Is	
■ Requires Minor Revision	
☐ Requires Major Revision	
☐ Reject	

Return Date:

The Growth of Drumstick (*Moringa oleifera* Lam.) Seedling under Artificial Shade and their Early Growth after Transplanting

Bambang Budi Santoso*[1], Jayaputra[1]

[1]Faculty of Agriculture, University of Mataram, INDONESIA
*Corresponding author: bambang.bs@unram.ac.id

Abstract Currently, *Moringa oleifera* multipurpose plant has become an important crop in the agro-industrial sector. In nursery propagation, suitable environmental conditions such irradiation is needed for the growth of seedlings. Modifying the sunlight intensity through setting the shade is an important thing must be considered. This study consisted of three experiments. The first and the second were carried out using black paranet shading, e.g. 90% shading (105.13 lux) using three layers of paranet; 65% shading (387.61 lux) using two layers of paranet; 35% shading (787.96 lux) using one layer of paranet, and without paranet shading (1,479.23 lux) for test the seed viability with five replications, and each replication consisted of 100 seeds, and test the seedlings growth with five replications, and each replication consisted of fifteen seedlings series. Third, an experiment to test the adaptability of seedlings from the second experiment to the production field, through the grid system planting method which was repeated three times and each replication consisted of 10 seedlings. The results showed that the level of shade had a significant effect on seed viability, seedling growth, and early adaptability of seedlings in the production field. The best quality *M. oleifera* seedlings could be obtained by application of artificial shade using one layer of black paranet with a shade level of 35% (787.96 lux).

Keywords adaptation, intensity, environment, light, paranet

---

1. Introduction

Moringa oleifera Lam (drumstick) is one of the cultivated species from the *Moringacae* family and it's a multipurpose tree. This tree is native to the Himalayan region in India which then spread widely in most tropical regions [1], including in Indonesia. This tree is a drought-resistant plant characterized by shedding its leaves when conditions very dry and then flourishing after the tree gets water or rains. This tree grows well in areas with annual rainfall ranging from 250-1,500 mm and temperatures in the range of 25-40 ^{O}C even up to 48 ^{O}C [2].

In relation to the many benefits and uses of *M. oleifera* trees, in the last few years this plant have come to the attention of researchers and growers or farmers. As a vegetable or herbal raw material, Moringa leaves contain great nutrients such as vitamine A, vitamine C, and calcium [3], important amino acids like methionine, tryptophan, and lysine, as well as a variety of phytochemicals that act as antioxidants [4]. The seeds can be used as water purifiers [5] [6], and also the seed oil possibly used as a cosmetic and health material due to have several medical properties, as well as an alternative source of raw materials to replace diesel fuel [7] [8] [9].

Although *M. oleifera* is a plant that is resistant to dry environmental conditions and will also be able to grow well in humid tropical areas and limited soil nutrient conditions [10], of course the proper cultivation technology is needed to get optimal products. It is necessary to develop its cultivation technology. The development of *M. oleifera* trees certainly requires the availability of quality seedlings. The use of quality seedlings can produce stands with a high level of leaf biomass productivity. The quality of seedlings in nurseries is strongly influenced by environmental factors besides genetic factors. Therefore, starting *M. oleifera* cultivation, which is a perenial plant, providing good and quality seeds to increase the growth of moringa in the production field needs intense attention.

In the process of plant propagation, the growing media and the size of the container for root growth and development are very important to note, because in this growing medium that the availability of water, nutrients and also oxygen supports the continuity of root growth and development to ensure the growth of the seedlings as a whole [11]. In the nursery period, environmental factors such as growth medium and light intensity are factors that determine the quality of growth of plant seedlings. It is well known, that different light conditions will certainly have an effect on the variation of plant morphology and physiology, and the degree of adaptation is also determined by the genetic characteristics that interact with the environment. Related to lighting, the light intensity factor plays a greater role in plant growth than the quality of light. Therefore, setting the level of shade by preparing artificial shade at the nursery stage is certainly very important to provide tolerable conditions for certain plant species, and then determines the growth and development of seedlings.

Then, Jahn et al. [12] reported that seeds germination and growth of *M. oleifera* seedlings were influenced by light conditions and it was recommended that half the seedling growth period be given screen. Mohamad [13] mentions that forest tree seedlings that grow at light intensities of 30% and 50% have tall stems and thin shoots with broad leaves that were dark green but lack the root system. Wardani and Latifah [14] reported that the height of *Dictyoneura acuminate* forest plant seedlings was influenced by light intensity, it was the less light intensity the longer the shoots. Whereas *M. oleifera* seedlings which were cultivated at a high level of shading produce weak and succulent seedlings [15]. Baru (*Dipteryx alata* Vog.) seedling emergence and emergence speed [16], have been found to be unaffected by 50% shading during seedling development. Moreover, de Sousa et al. [17] suggested that to produce good *Tachigali myrmecophila* seedlings, nurseries should be conditioned to have artificial shade levels ranging from 50-75% solar radiation.

In general, it can be said that from the marks of the previous studies above, there was no exact information on how much shade intensity is needed to produce *M. oleifera* seedlings which, after being transplanted in the production field, will provide good growth. Apart from that, high-quality seedlings with better development and early growth can be produced in seedling nurseries by using the proper artificial shading. It also in order to reduce seedling management, seedling mortality rate, and production costs, these seedlings can keep short and simple in seedling nurseries.

Therefore, there is a need to carry out studies to determine the appropriate shading levels for the production of *M. oleifera* seedlings. This article describes the results of our study that aims to determine the effect of shade on seed germination, seedling growth, and then its effect on the adaptability or growth of *M. oleifera* seedlings in the early period of growth in the production field.

2. Materials and Methods

2.1. Time and Location of Experiment

Series of experiments were carried out in July-December 2020. The germination and nursery experiments were conducted at the nursery location in the city of Mataram, West Nusa Tenggara (WNT), Indonesia with a geographical position at the coordinate point 8^{O}34'47.19"S 116^{O}05'47.91"E and altitude 16 m asl. The air conditions during three months of the seedling experiment were temperature 27.4-30.6 ^{O}C and humidity of 83-87%. Experiments in the production field was carried out in the Amor-Amor, Gumantar Village, North Lombok Regency, WNT with a geographical position at 8^{O}16'15.02"S 116^{O}17'34.02"E, altitude of 50-110 m asl with soil type of Entisol geluh sandstone composed of sand (69%), dust (25%), and clay (5%), with 1.8% organic carbon, 0.2% total nitrogen (N), pH around 5.9-6.3, and cation exchange capacity 7.2-10.4 cmol.kg^{-1}.

2.2. Plant Materials and Tools

M. oleifera seeds were used and obtained from adult moringa trees growing in homes yard in the Panggung Village, North Lombok Regency, WNT. Ripe fruit (brown) was collected from ten trees that appear to grow best and fertile. In connection with better seed viability, seeds which in the base and middle position of the fruit (pod) were selected [18]. A total of 50 pieces were taken from each plant, and the seeds were mixed then dried for 2 days. The selected seeds were then stored in a polypropylene plastic bag, and ready for applay in experiments. The instrument used to measure the intensity of light under the black paranet was Accu PAR/PAR-LAI CEPTOMETER LP-80, Decagon Devices, Inc

2.3. Treatment and Experiment Design

The shading material prepared for the experiments was black paranet. For shade of S1 (90% of shade =105.13 lux), three layers of paranet were used; for shade of S2 (65% of shade = 387.61 lux), two layers of paranet; for shade of S3 (35% of shade =787.96 lux), one layer of paranet was used; and without shading paranet for control, S4 (1,479.23 lux).

Paranet installed as a shade as high as 1.7 meters above the nursery beds measuring 2.0 m x 1.5 m.

The study consisted of three stages of the experiment, the first stage was aimed at knowing seed viability at various shading levels, and the second stage was aimed at knowing the growth of *M. oleifera* seedlings up to the age of two months from each shade level, and the third stage was an experiment aimed at knowing the adaptability of the seedlings *M. oleifera* originating from three levels of shade in the early period grew in the production field.

The experiments were arranged according to the Randomized Block Design, with four shading level treatments (described above). To find out the viability of seeds due to shade, a plastic box of 45 cm x 25 cm x 10 cm was prepared containing germination media in the form of a soil-sand-rice hull charcoal mixture (1:1:1 v/v) each made five replications, and each repetition consists of 100 seeds. Normal sprouts produced from each lot of seed viability testing were then planted as a second experiment on black polybags (measuring 15 cm x 25 cm) of five replications and each replication consisted of fifteen series of seed polybags. The nursery media in polybags was a mixtured of soil and bamboo leaf litter compost (1:1 v/v). In the third experiment, planting with a grid system in the field of seedlings that were 2 months old was carried out to determine the adaptability of the seeds obtained in the second experiment. Each row of each seedling from the four shade levels consists of 10 plant seeds and was repeated 3 rows alternating between the shade levels. Planting in the field was arranged with a spacing of 50 cm in rows and 75 cm between rows.

2.4. Seedling Maintenance

The study of seeds germination and seedling growth were carried out under the auspices of black paranet with manual watering every two days. After two weeks of transplanting seedlings to polybags, seedlings were fertilized with 5 g of NPK Phonska (15-15-15) each polybag. Control of pests and diseases was completed by spraying an insecticide of Lamda Sihalotrin and fungicides of Mancozeb. Seedlings were maintained for two months since transplanting. Into the planting hole buried cow manure as much as 2 kg per hole a day before transplanting. Watering was through every two weeks for 3 months of testing.

2.5. Data Observation and Analysis

A total of 10 samples of 100 seeds were weighed for each test. Weight measurements using sensitive electronic scales (0.01 mg) (OHAUS Precision Plus brand). From each unit of 100 seeds germinated in the germination container observed for 21 days of germination, germination rate, and number of normal seeds germinated. Seedling growth variables in the polybags were evaluated included seedling height, stem diameter, number of leaves, and dry weight per once a month. Adaptability of seedlings in the field was evaluated by calculating the percentage of seedlings survive (live), height, and number of leaves.

Data were analyzed by ANOVA at $P \leq 0.05$ confidence level and standard deviation of the average value of each variable of seed viability and seedling growth, as well as adaptability using the Minitab-14 software.

3. Results and Discussions

3.1. Results

Environmental factors that play an important role for seedling and plant growth and development are light, one of which is in the form of light intensity. The excessive lighting can be adjusting through the shade settings. In this study the data obtained that the air temperature at each shade level during the seedling nursery study which was observed every 12.30-13.00 during the day were recorded as follows; S1 (29.12±1.52 ^{O}C); S2 (30.03±1.83 ^{O}C); S3 (30.61±2.35 ^{O}C); and S4 (32.66±2.51 ^{O}C). And for air humidity data were recorded as follows; S1 (88.11±2.22%); S2 (86.78±2.05%); S3 (85.57±2.26%); and S4 (84.76±2.72%). Climatic conditions for the three months of the field experiment were showed in Table 1 below.

Table 1. Climatic conditions in the production field during the three months trial period

Month (2020)	Temperature (^{O}C)		Relative Humidity (%)		Rain	
	Max.	Min.	Max.	Min.	Raini days	Rainfall (mm)
October	36	24	98	66	2	4
November	34	24	98	73	10	82
December	31	23	99	80	12	244

Source: primary processed data

In relation to shading arrangements in the moringa plant nursery through this experiment, the fact that the shade effect was significantly on the seed vigor at P ≤ 0.05 (Table 2), as well as the growth variable of seedlings during the two months nursery period (Table 3 and Table 4). The significantly effect of shade can also be seen on the initial adaptability of plants in production fields (Table 5).

Table 2. Seeds vigor of *M. oleifera* seeds at three levels of nursery shade

Shading level	Weight of 100 seeds (g)	Seed germinated (%)	Germination rate (days)	Normal Sprout (%)	Seedling Dry Weight * (g)
90 % (105.13 lux)	25.2	82.7 a	5.8 a	66.6 a	0.35 a
65 % (387.61 lux)	25.6	95.3 c	6.1 a	81.3 b	0.88 bc
35 % (787.96 lux)	24.9	96.7 c	8.7 b	95.8 c	0.93 c
No shading (1,479.23 lux)	24.7	89.3 b	11.5 c	93.5 c	0.76 b
HSD 5%	-	5.52	2.35	9.92	0.13

Note: * Seedling dry weight was measured 30 days after seeds sowing. The numbers in each column followed by the same letter were not significantly different according to the 5% HSD test

Table 3. Growth of *Moringa* seedling canopy components at nursery shade levels

Shading level	Seedling height (cm)		Number of leaves		Stem Diameter (cm)	
	first month	second month	first month	second month	first month	second month
90 % (105.13 lux)	42.8 c	81.4 c	8.1	11.9 a	0.19	0.33 a
65 % (387.61 lux)	34.7 b	63.6 b	8.6	13.5 b	0.22	0.51 b
35 % (787.96 lux)	30.5 b	58.2 ab	8.9	15.5c	0.31	0.69 c
No shading (1,479.23 lux)	25.3 a	52.8 a	8.5	13.6 b	0.24	0.53 b
HSD 5%	4.56	6.8	-	1.5	-	0.15

Note: The numbers in each column followed by the same letter were not significantly different according to the 5% HSD test

Table 4. Dry weight of seedling and T/R ratio of seedlings

Shading level	Dry weight of canopy (T) (g)		Dry weight of root (R) (g)		T/R ratio	
	first month	second month	first month	second month	first month	second month
90 % (105.13 lux)	0.53	2.97 a	0.22	1.71 a	2.41	1.74
65 % (387.61 lux)	0.88	3.69 ab	0.41	2.21 b	2.15	1.67
35 % (787.96 lux)	1.13	4.88 c	0.72	2.99 d	1.70	1.51
No shading (1,479.23 lux)	0.69	3.78 b	0.51	2.66 c	1.61	1.42
HSD 5%	-	0.63	-	0.31	-	-

Note: The numbers in each column followed by the same letter were not significantly different according to the 5% HSD test

Table 5. Plant height, number of plant leaves, and number of live seedlings after transplanting

Shading level	Plant height (cm)		Number of leaves		Number of live seedlings (%)	
	first month	second month	first month	second month	first month	second month
90 % (105.13 lux)	85.8 c	89.2 b	10.4 a	11.3 a	86.7a	63.3 a
65 % (387.61 lux)	69.3 b	79.3 a	13.2 b	14.5 b	96.7b	76.7 b
35 % (787.96 lux)	66.5 ab	78.9 a	17.6 c	19.4 c	100.0b	100.0d
No shading (1,479.23 lux)	62.6 a	78.5 a	16.6 c	18.5 c	93.3b	93.3 c
HSD 5%	5.7	6.2	2.53	3.57	7.62	6.45

Note: The numbers in each column followed by the same letter were not significantly different according to the 5% HSD test

In Table 2 it appears that the 35% shade level in *M. oleifera* seedlings was the best shading level conditions for obtaining viability of *M. oleifera* seedlings to then grow and develop. Meanwhile shade levels up to 90% was an

uncondusive condition for germination and growth of *M. oleifera* seedlings. At this level of shading, seed germinated, seed germination rate, number of normal seed sprout, and seedling dry weight appear to be the lowest compared to other shade levels. The percentage of germination of *M. oleifera* seeds was obtained low under high shading levels may be due to the effect of low soil temperatures or low light intensity or both. In general, the experimental results shows that the percentage of moringa seed germination was quiet in the high category under all shade level to without shade. This means *M. oleifera* seeds can germinate at various temperatures and less light intensity, and also show that *M. oleifera* seed was quite hardy to high temperatures and open light.

The success of seedlings growing and developing into a quality seedling was also influenced by the level of shade (Table 3 and Table 4). Shading less to 35% appears as a shade intensity conducive to growth and then good quality *M. oleifera* seedlings. In the shade condition of 35%, the seedling height was neither too low nor too high. At the height of the seedlings there was found that the highest number of leaves and the largest stem diameter compared to seedlings at other shade levels (Table 3). The manifestation of the seedling growth component described in Table 3, was the weight of both canopy and root biomass, elaborated in Table 4, and shows that shade less to 35% was also found that the best shade level compared to other shade levels.

The findings of this study in general showed that seedling of *M. oleifera* in the low shade (35%) to without shade produces seedlings that were upright and sturdy but in the medium to high shade (65-90%) produce soft or soft seeds and easy to fall. This indicates that *M. oleifera* seedlings in conditions of receiving more light would be better used in photosynthesis and then a balanced carbohydrate partition between the above (canopy) and underground (root) parts.

Seedling transplanting in the production field was the initial stage of perennial crop cultivation such as *M. oleifera*, where moringa plants interact with the planting environment, both individually and in population. At the beginning of the growth after transplanting, various seeds obtained from different levels of shade showed a variety of adaptation levels (Table 5). The results showed that seedlings originating from shade 35% and without shade were the best adapted for up to 2 months of the initial growth period in the production field.

3.2. Discussion

Light is an abiotic factor that plays an important role in horticultural production, in relation to its importance for photosynthesis, biochemical and biophysical processes in terms of producing biomass. At the nursery stage, ensuring the right intensity of light is essential for the achievement of the photosynthesis process that supports the acquisition of large biomass and then forms an integral part of the plant [19]. However, the optimal light intensity for growth and development varies greatly between species and even plant eco-types. Therefore, redesigning photosynthesis for the seedling nursery of *M. oleifera* plants through shade manipulation may be useful to lessen the effects of excess or insufficient light scattering. In this study, observations and measurements were carried out ranging from seed germination to seedling planting on the production site. The experiment was conducted with the aim of determining the need for a more accurate light intensity of *M. oleifera* seedlings. The experiment's findings then demonstrated that the selection of the shadow level with a black paranet had a discernible impact on the level of light.

Plants grown from seeds initially grow slowly because growth during those periods was being primarily focused on root development, making plants extremely susceptible to the competing of growth factors. In this trial, it was discovered that it could take up to 11 days from the time the *M. oleifera* seeds were sown until they surfaced on the planting medium. During the experiment some seeds were found to germinate after the end of the observation period. According to [20], sowing seeds (seeds with a high fat content) result in a low proportion of germinated seeds and produces seedlings with slow growth. Success depends on a number of highly favorable circumstances, including the availability of enough soil moisture, the correct depth of hole, and the number (multiple seeds) per hole. According to reference of [21], sowing *M. oleifera* seeds directly is still possible as long as the seeds are of good quality and viability.

The survival of seedlings after transplantation is a complex process that could be influenced by many factors. One important factor if the conditions of the field of production are the same, of course, is the quality of seedlings to be transplanted. Good seed quality is determined by the propagation nursery environment in which it is carried out, including the lighting, which could be manipulated through the shading. In general, it could be said that a shade level of up to 35% was ideal for maintaining the seedlings of *M. oleifera* plants. In addition to being beneficial for seed vigor, it was also beneficial for seedling growth at the nursery and results in seedlings that are highly adaptable on the production field during the two-month growth phase following the transplant.

The findings of this research also indicate that *M. oleifera* seeds and seedlings grow without any difficulty in open space, despite the fact that the moringa plant's early development could be characterized as slow. While Zhang et al. [22] claimed that only a certain amount of shade can improve shade plant biomass, and reference of [23] claimed that complete exposure to sunlight can benefit plant biomass accumulation, particularly for sun plants. Additionally, the natural shade due to the shedding by leguminous trees could be a determining factor in the growth appearance of an Abaca banana which may be due to its influence on water and nutrient needs [24]. Therefore, based on the results of our experiments, it

is possible to conclude that *M. oleifera* is a plant that prefers light (light-loving plant or sun plant type).

Different plants will grow at varying degrees of shade due to the altered environmental conditions brought about by artificial shading. According to reference of [25], greater shading levels will result in reduced air temperature, soil temperature, and light intensity, but higher moisture levels. In young plants at the nursery level, shading causes a distinctive morphological development and then causes a physiological reaction [26].

The best growth of *Jatropha* seedlings, according to [27], occurred in an environment with a shade level of approximately 330 mol $m^{-2}s^{-1}$ seconds of photon flow, or equal to 50% shadow. This environment was characterized by an increase of 140% in total seedling dry material. Additionally, references of [28] and [29] claimed that the biomass ratio between the seedling's shoot and root represents the distribution of photosynthate between the top and bottom of the plant. According to this research, *M. oleifera* seedlings from low-light environments would devote more biomass to their stems and leaves (shoot), increasing the shoot/root ratio.

The findings of this research supported by [30] viewpoint. According to a study by [21] on seed-derived *M. oleifera* seedlings, the seed has a high chance of adapting to the production field after seedling transplantation the smaller the value (near 1) of the shoot/root ratio. *Jatropha* seedlings from seeds with a shoot/root ratio value close to one or a smaller ration value were seedlings of higher quality, according to [31]. Similar to this, [32] claim that red pine seeds have a considerably higher total biomass in full light than in shade.

After seedlings are transplanted into a production field, the lower the shoot/root ratio, the better the plant and the greater the chance of plant survival [33], particularly in dry areas [26]. Additionally, *Parkia multijuga* Benth. seedlings with a lower T/R ratio have been shown to have higher seedling survival and better ability to survive after transplanting, as described by [34]. By lowering the T/R ratio, increased exposure to photosynthesis radiation raises the assimilation split into the root system. Moreover, according to [34], the loss of root weight in the shadow is caused by the restriction of plant water under full sunlight, which results in the accumulation of dry mass in the root system and lowers the build-up of assimilation on the top of seedlings.

Better *M. oleifera* seedlings were found in this research to be those which thus grow and develop under 35% or less sunlight. The findings of this research thus imply that the moringa plant is a sun-loving plant. The phenomenon would be that plants categorized as light-loving plants (sun) can increase their chlorophyll content when the light intensity is low, which makes them appear greener in nurseries and lowers the point of compensation and light saturation and increases light absorption and photosynthesis. The seedlings, on the other hand, look paler when they were exposed to higher shades (65% to 90%), or low light intensities. The accumulation of clear photosynthesis products and compounds required for regular growth will be reduced over extended times of low light intensity, which will result in a decrease in biomass [35] [36].

Thus, full light circumstances up to a shade level of about 35% can be used in a propagation environment to enhance the growth (biomass) of *M. oleifera* seedlings. Shading is a crucial cultivation approach for crop planting because it will produce high-quality seedlings, which will then produce a high percentage of adaptable seedlings on the production field after transplantation [37]. It was discovered in this research (see Table 4) that the shoot biomass and root biomass of the seedlings increased with increasing light intensity or decreasing shading levels arising in seedlings with a shoot/root (T/R) ratio of 1.51 thereafter. The nursery environment with a 35% shading level stored the greatest dry mass accumulation of *M. oleifera* seedlings. The seedlings did not achieve the point of light saturation in this environment. The environment facilitated faster initial seedling development because the energy from photosynthesis may have been used to build the dry mass of the shoot (shoots) and roots. These seedlings were found to be of high quality, which was determined by how adaptable they were after being transplanted in the production field (number of live seedlings in Table 5).

Therefore, although *M. oleifera* is an annual plant that can grow both in widespread environmental conditions, even in extreme climatic conditions [38], but in efforts to develop intensive farms or plantation in relation to the many benefits of this plant from as a medicinal material to human food and also as a feed for livestock [39], appropriate and efficient quality seedling preparation techniques are required. There is no good plantation without quality seedlings. Then the results of our research could be as a reference technique or method in multiplying planting material or *M. oleifera* seedlings

4. Conclusions

This study demonstrated how *M. oleifera* Lam. adaption to its environment in production fields is influenced by the amount of shade provided by black paranet. Raising *M. oleifera* seedlings under artificial shading using 35% black paranet (787.96 lux) will yield high-quality plants. Additionally, these high-quality seedlings offer the finest early development in fields of production under the same shade.

Acknowledgements

Author wish to acknowledge the Ministry of Research, Technology, and High Education (Kemenristekdikti) Indonesia Republic for research funding through the 2019-2020 PTUPT decentralization scheme, and to Mr. Sahru for technical assistance in the field.

REFERENCES

[1] Fahey JW. Moringa oleifera: A review of the medical evidence for its nutritional, therapeutic, and prophylactic properties. Part 1. Trees for Life Journal. Vol.1, No.5, 2005.

[2] Von Maydell HJ. Trees and shrubs of the Sahel, their characteristic and uses. Deutsche Geseliscraft fur Technische Zusammenarbeit (GTZ). Feredal Republic of Germany. pp: 334-337, 1996.

[3] Thurber MD, and Fahey JW. Adoption of Moringa oleifera to combat under-nutrition viewed through the lens of the "Diffusion of Innovations" theory. Ecol Food Nutr. Vol.48, No.3, 212-225, 2009.

[4] Potisate, Y., & Phoungchandang, S. Microwave drying of Moringa oleifera (Lam) leaves: drying characteristics and quality aspects. Asia-Pacific Journal of Science and Technology. Vol.20, No.1, 12-25, 2015.

[5] Dishna S. Water Clarification using Moringa oleifera. Gate Information Service, Schborn, Germany. 2000. http://www.gtz.de/gate/gateid.afp.

[6] Bhatia, S. Coagulation-flocculation process for POME treatment using Moringa aloe vera seeds extracts optimization studies. Chem. Eng. J. Vol.133, 205–212, 2007.

[7] Dorria, M.M.A., Mahfouze, H.A., Ali, E.A.M., & Abdelrahman, H.H. Morphological, Biochemical and Molecular Studies on Jatropha curcas Seedlings. Int. J. of Chem. Tech. Research. Vol.9, No.07, 37-45, 2016.

[8] Gandji, K., Chadare, F.J., Idohou, R., Salako, V.K., Assogbadjo, A.E., Glele Kakai, R.L. Status and utilisasion of Moringa oleifera Lam.: a review. Afric. Crop Sci. J. Vol.26, No.137, 2018. doi.org/10.4314/acsj.v26i1.10

[9] Azlan, U. K., Mediani, A., Rohani, E. R., Tong, X., Han, R., Norazlan, M. M., Hamezah, H. S. A comprehensive review with updated future perspectives on the ethno medicinal and pharmacological aspects of Moringa oleifera. Molecules, Vol.27, No.18, 5765, 2022. https://doi.org/10.3390/ molecules27185765

[10] Farooq M, Basra SMA, Rehman H, Hussain M. Seed priming with polyamines improve the germination and early seedling growth in fine ruce. J New Seeds. Vol.9, 145-155, 2008

[11] Mohamed, Y.F.Y. Influence of Different Growing Media and Kristalon Chemical Fertilizer on Growth and Chemical Composition of Areca Palm (Dypsis cabadae H. E. Moore) Plant. Middle East Journal of Applied Sciences. Vol.08, No.01, 43-56, 2018.

[12] Jahn SAA, Musnad HA and Burgstaller H. The tree that purifies water: Cultivating multipurpose Moringaceae in the Sudan. Unasylva, Vol.38, 23-28, 1986.

[13] Mohamad AB. Light requirements of Shorea materialis seedlings. Forest Research Institute Malaysia (FRIM), Kepong, Selangor, Malaysia. Pertanika. Vol.9, No.3, 285–289, 1986.

[14] Wardani FF dan Latifah D. Perkecambahan biji Dictyoneura acuminata Blume pada cahaya merah dan merah jauh. J. Hort. Indonesia. Vol.7, No.1, 49-55, 2016. [Indonesian Journal]

[15] Ahmed, L.T., Abdelgadir, A.Y., Mahmmoud, A.E., Warrag, E.I. Effect of shade on xylem development of Moringa oleifera (Alrawag) seedlings. U. of K.J. Agric. Sci. Vol.19, No.2, 188-201, 2011.

[16] da Costa, G. G. S., Costa, E., da Silva, E. M., Borges, R. S., da Silva Binotti, F. F., Vieira, G. H. C., & de Souza, A. F. G. O. Shading level, reflective material, and seeding depth on the growth of baru seedlings. Agricultural Engineering International: CIGR Journal, Vol.22, No.4, 83-92, 2020.

[17] de Sousa, P.R.F., B. da Silva Casseb, M. C. da Silva, L. F. Palheta, P. H. O. Simões, C. C. Lima, N. C. de Almeida Azevedo, L. F. F. da Silva, D.G. de Araujo, G. A. dos Santos Nogueira, C. F. de Oliveira Neto, L. I. S. de Sousa, A. P. de Paiva, H. C. G. Pires, M. T. de Paula. Influence of artificial shading on seedling production of Tachigali myrmecophila (Ducke) Ducke. AJCS, Vol.13, No.10, 1572-1577, 2019. doi: 10.21475/ajcs.19.13.10.p1657

[18] Santoso, B.B. dan Parwata I.G.M.A. Viabilitas biji dan pertumbuhan bibit kelor (Moringa oleifera Lam.)-Seed viability and growth of Moringa oleifera Lam. seedling. J. Sains & Teknologi. Vol.3, No.2, 1-8, 2017. DOI: https://doi.org/10.29303/jstl.v3i2.18. [Indonesian Journal]

[19] Sun, J., Li X.M, and Zhang J. Preliminary studies on the influence of light intensity on growth and saponin contents of Dioscorea zingiberensis. Acta Bot. Boreal. Occident. Sin. Vol.31, 536-542, 2011.

[20] Rijssenbeek, W. Jatropha Planting Mannual. Handbook on Jatropha curcas. FACT Foundation. 2006. www.fact-fuaels.org [September 2017].

[21] Hilal S, Parwata IGMA, Santoso BB. Growth of Drum Stick (Moringa oleifera Lam.) seedling derivated from seed at different phases of transplanting. J. Sains Teknologi & Lingkungan. Vol.4, No.1, 54-63, 2018. DOI: https://doi.org/ 10.29303/jstl.v4i1.71 [Indonesian Journal]

[22] Zhang YJ, Meng XH, Yang DF, Xu L, and Zhang XY. Comparative study on chemical constituents of Pinellia ternate (Thunb.) Breit under different light intensities. J. Wuhan Bot. Res. Vol.27, 533-536, 2009.

[23] Ding XT, Jin HJ, Zhang HM, and Yu JZ. Effect of shading on growth and diurnal photosynthetic changes of four vegetables in glasshouse. Acta Agric. Zhejian Vol.22, 51-56, 2010.

[24] Gene T. Señeris, Evelyn P. Vedasto, Malco M. Teodosio, Melba L. Ragaas, Lelisa J. Teodosio , "Morphological Characteristics of Abaca (Musa textilis Nee') Cultivars Grown in Two Municipalities of Aklan, Philippines," Universal Journal of Agricultural Research, Vol. 10, No. 2, pp. 175 - 183, 2022. DOI: 10.13189/ujar.2022.100209.

[25] Hamdani JS, Sumadi, Suriadinata YR, Martins L. Pengaruh naungan dan zat pengatur tumbuh terhadap pertumbuhan dan hasil tanaman kentang kultivar Atlantik di dataran medium. J. Agron. Indonesia. Vol.44, No. 1, 33-39, 2016. [Indonesian Journal]

[26] Santelices R, Navarro-Cerrillo RM, Drake F. Propagation and seedling cultivation of the endemic species Nothofagus alessandrii Espinosa in Central Chile. Restoration Ecology. Vol.19, 177-185, 2011. DOI: 10.1111/j.1526-100X. 2009.00550.x

[27] Martins, L. D., W. N. Rodrigues, T. V. Colodetti, S. B. Brinate, W. N. Rodrigues, J. F. T. Amaral, M. A. Tomaz, J. C. Lopes and B. G. Laviola. Seedling growth of physic nut (Jatropha curcas L.) genotypes under different photosynthetic photon flux density. AJCS. Vol.8, No.9, 1343-1347, 2014.

[28] Li XD, Zhang CP and Fu H. Seasonal dynamics of root shoot ratio and the effect of factors in grazed and ungrazed grasslands of the Loess Plateau. Acta Pratac. Sin. Vol.21, 307-312, 2012.

[29] Yang TT, Gao Y, Wu XH, Li P, and Shi HXStudy on seasonal variation of above ground and under-ground biomasses of vegetation in the Stipa klemenzii steppe and their ratio. Arid Zone Res. Vol.30, 109-114, 2013.

[30] Mc. Connagughay K and Coleman J. Biomass allocation in plants: ontogeny or optimality? A test along three resources gradients. Ecology Vol.80, 2581-2593, 1999. DOI: 10.1890/0012-9658(1999)080 [2581: BAIPOO]2.0.CO;2

[31] Santoso BB, dan Purwoko BS. Tehnik Pembibitan Tanaman Jarak Pagar (Jatropha curcas L). Crop Agro Vol.1, No.2, 25-33, 2008. [Indonesian Journal]

[32] Elliott KJ and White AS. Effects of Light, Nitrogen, and Phosphorus on Red Pine Seedling Growth and Nutrient Use Efficiency. Forest Science. Vol.40, No.1, 47-58, 1994.

[33] Poorter, H., Nagel, O. The role of biomass allocation in the growth response of plants to different levels of light, CO2, nutrients and water: aquantitative review. Australian Journal of Plant Physiology. Vol.27, No. 12, 1191, 2000. DOI: 10.1071/PP99173_CO.

[34] Maekawa, L., Maria de Fatima Barbosa Coelho, Oscarlina Lúcia dos Santos Weber. Container volume and shading in Parkia multijuga Benth. propagation in nursery. Iheringia, Série Botânica, Porto Alegre, Vol.75, e2020012, 2020. DOI 10.21826/2446-82312020v75e2020012

[35] Guo JX, Xia YT, He J and Zhu GF. Physiological responses to lighting and shading in two ornamental plants. Guangdong Agric. Sci. Vol.43, 67-70, 2010.

[36] Qin YL, Wu JY, Xu YC and Yuan XH. Effects of shading on the growth, photosynthetic characteristics and biomass of ornamental grass Eragrostis spectabilis. Acta Agrestia Sin. Vol.21, 921-927, 2013.

[37] Vazquez de Castro A, Oliet JA, Puertolas J, Jacobs DF. Light transmissivity of tube shelters affects root growth and biomass allocation of Quercus ilex L. and Pinus halepensis. Mill. Annals of Forest Science. Vol.71, 91-99, 2014. DOI:10.1007/s13595-013-0335-3

[38] Mashamaite CV, Pieterse PJ, Mothapo PN, Phiri EE. Moringa oleifera in South Africa: A review on its production, growing conditions and consumption as a food source. S Afr J Sci. Vol.117, No.3/4, 1-7, 2021. https://doi.org/10.17159/sajs.2021/8689

[39] Ndhlala, A.R., Madala, N.E., Ncube, B. Editorial: Moringa Research special issue. South Africa Journal of Botany. Vol.129, 1-2, 2020. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sajb.2020.03.031